

ISSUE	ACTION	ASSESSMENT	WORK GROUP	RESOLUTION
Issue 3276: UML RTF 1.4 Issue: Dynamic concurrency arguments	defer to ActionSemantics		AWG	
Issue 3382: UML 1.4 issue: Top state in activity graphs	deferred 2.0		AWG	
Issue 2293: action state symbol/state symbol difficult to distinguish when drawn by ha	rejected		AWG	
Issue 3243: ISSUE FOR UML, SECTION ActivityGraphs	rejected		AWG	
Issue 3244: Issue Activity Package	rejected		AWG	
Issue 1040: Well-formedness rules only expressed in English	resolved	med	AWG	OCL added to rules, or an explanation given why not in most cases. A new tag called "usage" is added to transitions that have an ObjectFlowState as source or target. The tag value indicates whether the action of the state at the other end of the transition modifies or only reads the flowing object. Notation for CallState is added. The name of the class of object receiving the call is placed in parentheses below the action name. The following wf rules in the state machine chapter are modified to not apply to activity graphs: PseudoState 4, 6, and Transition 1, 3, 4.
Issue 2546: (Minor) Activity diagram change recommendation	resolved		AWG	
Issue 3273: UML RTF 1.4 Issue: Notation for call state	resolved	small	AWG	
Issue 1886: Rules 3 and 4 for Transitions in state machines should be limited	resolved	med	AWG	
Issue 2005: Synchronous action	defer to ActionSemantics	med	CBWG	
Issue 3285: UML RTF 1.4 Issue: Parallel action iteration	defer to ActionSemantics	med	CBWG	
Issue 3286: UML RTF 1.4 Issue: CreateAction links to only one classifier.	defer to ActionSemantics	med	CBWG	
Issue 2004: Asynchronous action	rejected	med	CBWG	
Issue 2006: Synchronous request	rejected	med	CBWG	
Issue 3287: UML RTF 1.4 Issue: Action composition meta-modelled improperly:	rejected	med	CBWG	
Issue 1940: Section 5.17 of Notation Guide: No mapping is given	resolved	small	CBWG	Clarified mapping to ClassifierInState.
Issue 3288: UML RTF 1.4 Issue: What does it mean for ReturnAction to be synchronous?	resolved	med	CBWG	Added well-formedness rule that return action is always asynchronous.
Issue 3398: UML RTF 1.4 editorial comments (Part 3 - Behavioral Elements)	resolved		CBWG	Corrected a number of more or less significant typos.
Issue 3631: Setting Action as abstract in UML-MetaModel MDL to correspond to Semantics	resolved		CBWG	Action and Instance have both been set to be Abstract.
Issue 3637: Incorrect section numbering	resolved		CBWG	The numbers have been updated.
Issue i007: upgrade component model to deal with EJB, CCM, COM	resolved	high	CmpWG	Updated notation and sharpened semantics by adding metaclass Artifact.
Issue 2626: Strange General use restriction	fixed in 1.3		common	
Issue 1184: Set of inheritable features not defined	resolved	med	common	
Issue 3275: UML RTF 1.4 Issue: Join in collaboration	deferred 2.0	med	CWG	
Issue 3368: Efficient diagrammatic notation for Collaboration Specifications	deferred 2.0		CWG	
Issue 3376: ClassifierRoles should be independent of specific underlying base Classifier	deferred 2.0		CWG	
Issue 1047: No mapping for swimlanes in Sequence Diagram	resolved	small	CWG	The text is removed as swimlanes appear in activity graphs and not in collaboration notation. Can be reconsidered for 2.0.
Issue 2837: role concept in UML remains rather vague	resolved		CWG	The term role is used in e.g. collaborations and associations with different but well-defined semantics
Issue 3282: UML RTF 1.4 Issue: Confusing example of sequence diagram	resolved	med	CWG	The text describing creation in a sequence diagram is clarified
Issue 3289: UML RTF 1.4 Issue: Create action in collaborations	resolved	med	CWG	The text is clarified as roles themselves cannot be instantiated
Issue 3292: Incorrect example of constraining elements in collaborations.	resolved	med	CWG	No, but an additional example is provided.
Issue 3293: UML RTF 1.4 Issue: Multi-objects in collaborations	resolved	med	CWG	The text is clarified
Issue 3294: UML RTF 1.4 Issue: Guard condition in collaborations poorly named.	resolved	small	CWG	Guards as such removed from Collaborations - they are now named Conditions, to avoid confusion with the formal concept of Guards in State Machines.
Issue 3295: UML RTF 1.4 Issue: Messages do not have signatures	resolved	med (clarify)	CWG	The text is clarified
Issue 3296: Misleading description of feature inheritance on roles.	resolved	med	CWG	The text is clarified
Issue 3366: Design patterns and collaboration templates.	resolved	small	CWG	duplicate of 3375, 1016
Issue 3367: Terminology: Collaboration and Collaboration Template	resolved		CWG	Changed to consistent usage of the terms
Issue 3369: Focus is on 2.10 Collaborations	resolved		CWG	Fixed by introducing collaboration instance to UML 1.4.
Issue 3370: 2. In 2.10.1, 3rd paragraph, it should be "OOram", not "OOFram".	resolved		CWG	Fixed
Issue 3371: why is AssociationRole is a subtype of Association?	resolved		CWG	The text is clarified
Issue 3373: Confusing wording	resolved	small	CWG	Fixed
Issue 3374: Page 2-114, 2nd paragraph. It should be collaboration template	resolved		CWG	Fixed
Issue 3375: In 2.10.5, you give pattern a non-standard definition	resolved		CWG	In UML a pattern is less powerful than in e.g. the Gamma book. Can be extended for Uml 2.0.
Issue 3378: In 2.10.4, semantics of Collaboration, the 1st sentence is confusing	resolved		CWG	Fixed by introducing collaboration instance to UML 1.4.
Issue i006: Define the set of Inheritable features for Collaboration	resolved	med	CWG	The inherited features are enumerated
Issue 3281: UML RTF 1.4 Issue: Arrowhead semantics in collaboration unclear	rsolved	med	CWG	The semantics and notation of the arrowheads have been simplified and made consistent. Only two different kinds are standard.
Issue 2298: Package symbol as a polygon	rejected		MMWG	
Issue 1010: UML 1.0: instances	resolved	small	MMWG	Packages can now contain instances. A general clean up has been done for all classifiers that are instantiable to make the metamodel more homogeneous.
Issue 3241: Shouldn't the UML Package be allowed to own/reference UML 'Instances'?	resolved	small	MMWG	See issue 1010

ISSUE	ACTION	ASSESSMENT	WORK GROUP	RESOLUTION
Issue i003: Define the set of inheritable features for Package (and verify for subtypes)	resolved	med	MMWG	The inheritable features are explicitly stated.
Issue 1790: Lack of features commonly used in OCL	deferred 2.0		OWG	
Issue 3392: OCL needs an abstract syntax, just like the UML metamodel	deferred 2.0	big	OWG	
Issue 3513: OCL: Usage of qualifiers	deferred 2.0	small	OWG	
Issue 2073: Widen the naming characteristics	fixed in 1.3		OWG	Was already fixed in 1.3, no changes in 1.4
Issue 2544: OCL Standard package	fixed in 1.3		OWG	Was already fixed in 1.3, no changes in 1.4
Issue 2566: The second postcondition on Integer::div is incorrect	fixed in 1.3		OWG	Was already fixed in 1.3, no changes in 1.4
Issue 2567: The postcondition on set::collect seems to be incorrect	fixed in 1.3		OWG	Was already fixed in 1.3, no changes in 1.4
Issue 2568: The postcondition seems to be incorrect for sequence::subSequence	fixed in 1.3		OWG	Was already fixed in 1.3, no changes in 1.4
Issue 2569: page 6-10 of OCL documentation	fixed in 1.3		OWG	Was already fixed in 1.3, no changes in 1.4
Issue 2570: pages 6-28 to 6-29 of OCL documentation	fixed in 1.3		OWG	Was already fixed in 1.3, no changes in 1.4
Issue 2571: Divide operator is incorrect	fixed in 1.3		OWG	Was already fixed in 1.3, no changes in 1.4
Issue 2572: The not-equals operator, "<>"	fixed in 1.3		OWG	Was already fixed in 1.3, no changes in 1.4
Issue 2573: Error in the third postcondition for String::concat on page 6-31	fixed in 1.3		OWG	Was already fixed in 1.3, no changes in 1.4
Issue 2786: OCL issue	fixed in 1.3		OWG	Was already fixed in 1.3, no changes in 1.4
Issue 2017: Set of allInstances should be referable by the class name	rejected	small	OWG	This introduces an ambiguity where the classname can be used as a collection of all instances or as the source for the class operations and attributes.
Issue 2305: OCL should allow one constraint to reference another	rejected	med	OWG	The Let construct solves this in a more structural way
Issue 3147: OCL: class operation has no 'self'	rejected	small	OWG	The proposed solution ('self' and 'Self' with starting capital seems too confusing.
Issue 3385: UML 1.4 RTF issue: OCL: Precedence of relational operators	rejected		OWG	The precedence of operators is left as in 1.3.
Issue 1104: OCL specification 1.1, p. 32	resolved	med	OWG	The explanation of '+' in the EBNF has been added
Issue 2015: Common operations should be added to collection types in OCL	resolved	med	OWG	Collection operation 'any()' has been added as standard operation.
Issue 3098: OCL Error	resolved	small	OWG	The definition of 'isUnique()' has been fixed.
Issue 3137: OCL: Consistency in grammar description	resolved	small	OWG	The grammar description has been made consistent.
Issue 3138: OCL: Are keywords reserved or not	resolved	small	OWG	Yes, keywords are reserved in OCL, an escape character can be used if needed.
Issue 3139: OCL: Class context specification grammar incomplete	resolved	small	OWG	Grammar for class context declaration is fixed to support the examples. The 'package' and 'endpackage' keywords are introduced to specify in which package a constraint belongs. This allows files with OCL constraints to be fully self-descriptive.
Issue 3140: textual syntax cannot deal with identical class names in different package	resolved	small	OWG	
Issue 3141: OCL: Feature calls on default target	resolved	small	OWG	The grammar for 'primaryExpression' is simplified for default feature calls. Syntax for enumeration types has changed from #enumvalue to EnumType::enumvalue. This is in line with the new definition of enumeration in the semantics section.
Issue 3142: OCL: Enumeration types	resolved	small	OWG	Syntax for enumeration types has changed from #enumvalue to EnumType::enumvalue. This is in line with the new definition of enumeration in the semantics section.
Issue 3143: OCL: Enumeration types inconsistent with UML metamodel	resolved	med	OWG	Grammar for literal collection ('literalCollectio' and 'collectionItem') has been fixed to make it more general.
Issue 3144: OCL: Literal collections	resolved	small	OWG	Grammar rules for numeric constants ('number') have been altered
Issue 3145: OCL: Numeric constants missing	resolved	small	OWG	Typo in grammar rule for 'string' has been fixed. Unicode strings have not been added.
Issue 3146: OCL: String literals	resolved	small	OWG	
Issue 3148: OCL: Let-expressions	resolved	med	OWG	Let expressions are much better defined. They can now have parameters and be attached to Classifiers to make them reusable.
Issue 3149: OCL: Samples of invalid typing	resolved	small	OWG	Some examples in section 7.4.4 have been fixed.
Issue 3383: OCL: Declarators for iterate	resolved	small	OWG	Grammar rule for 'declarator' changed.
Issue 3384: UML 1.4 RTF issue: OCL: Iterator declarators	resolved		OWG	Declarators added to several operations: isUnque() and sortedBy()
Issue 3386: UML 1.4 RTF issue: OCL: Unary operator "-" missing	resolved		OWG	Binary '-' operation added to Real.
Issue 3387: UML 1.4 RTF issue: OCL: navigation context in iterate	resolved		OWG	Added clarification that 'self' is always the original contextual object. No matter how deeply nested the expression is.
Issue 3389: UML 1.4 RTF issue: OCL: grammar is ambiguous	resolved		OWG	The 'typeName' grammar rule is dropped, and the 'pathName' used instead. Predefined operations must be used with brackets. I.e. ->isEmpty becomes ->isEmpty(). This is more consistent with their definition as operations and the notation for operations of user defined model classes.
Issue 3390: Change syntax of certain pre-defined operations	resolved		OWG	
Issue 2290: ElementOwnership	deferred 2.0		PhWG	
Issue 3123: "Physical" Metamodel Package Structure (uml-rtf)	deferred 2.0	med	PhWG	
Issue 3126: Operations and Constraints Missing from "Physical" Metamodels	deferred 2.0		PhWG	
Issue 3127: Data Types Misplaced in the "Physical" Metamodel (uml-rtf)	deferred 2.0	med	PhWG	
Issue 3122: Precise "Physical" Metamodels Missing from Specification (uml-rtf)	resolved	med	PhWG	The "Physical" Metamodel will be provided with UML 1.4 as an XML document.

ISSUE	ACTION	ASSESSMENT	WORK GROUP	RESOLUTION
Issue 3124: "Physical" Metamodel References (uml-rtf)	resolved	med	PhWG	Undesired implicit references are removed from the "Physical" Metamodel in UML 1.4.
Issue 3125: "Physical" Metamodel References in Diagrams (uml-rtf)	resolved	med	PhWG	All references of the "Physical" Metamodel are made explicit in UML 1.4.
Issue 2291: User-defined symbols for tagged values and properties	deferred 2.0		PWG	
Issue i005: Define the set of Inheritable features for Profile	duplicate	med	PWG	see 3210
Issue 2510: There is an association between between Constraint and ModelElement	rejected		PWG	The relationship is actually named "constraint" in UML1.3 and UML1.4. The end of the association which is opposed to Stereotype is named StereotypeConstraint, in UML1.3 and UML1.4. Multiple stereotypes can now be assigned to a ModelElement Stereotypes are GeneralizableElements and a discussion of what it means to subtype a Stereotype and what the applicable rules are has been added.
Issue 2282: Only single stereotyping is supported	resolved		PWG	
Issue 3210: Inheritance of Stereotypes	resolved	med	PWG	There was presumably a potential conflict between nested state regarding deferral of events. Apparently there is no conflict. Need to fix the text.
Issue 3278: UML RTF 1.4 Issue: Guard evaluation for choice points.	deferred 2.0	small	SMWG	
Issue 3259: State machine name space	duplicate 3341	small	SMWG	
Issue 2020: Guard in current metamodel can be replaced by Constraint with stereotype	rejected		SMWG	
Issue 2336: extension to the notation for a transition	rejected		SMWG	
Issue 3201: Why is "FinalState" a separate metaclass ?	rejected		SMWG	
Issue 3202: Another State machine issue	rejected	med	SMWG	
Issue 3277: UML RTF 1.4 Issue: Deferred event ambiguity	rejected	med	SMWG	
Issue 3280: UML RTF 1.4: Description of context role, between state machine and model	rejected	small	SMWG	
Issue 3341: Statemachine/state as Namespace	rejected		SMWG	
Issue 1204: Transition WFR badly written	resolved	small	SMWG	OCL has been fixed
Issue 1205: Bad example for LCA, main source, main target	resolved	small	SMWG	The example was OK, but exposed a problem in the definition of LCA to address the case where the LCA is a concurrent state
Issue 3153: Invalid OCL expression in initial transition	resolved	small	SMWG	OCL has been fixed
Issue 3274: UML RTF 1.4 Issue: State constraint on host object	resolved	med	SMWG	A standard stereotype <<stateInvariant>> has been added for this purpose (solution consistent with existing <<precondition>> and <<invariant>> standard stereotypes)
Issue 3297: UML RTF 1.4 Issue: Typo in state exit	resolved	small	SMWG	Typo fixed
Issue 3400: UML RTF 1.4 editorial comments (Part 9 - Statechart Diagrams)	resolved		SMWG	Comments incorporated (not all accepted)
Issue 3558: who owns an Event? (change Package ownership rule?)	resolved		SMWG	A Signal is a Classifier and hence owned by the Package in which it is defined. Events are owned by StateMachines
Issue 2449: Provide tools to chapter 5	defer to MOF		SWG	
Issue 1209: Parametrizable model elements not shown	deferred 2.0		SWG	
Issue 1512: Need for notation for dealing with evolution of UML models	deferred 2.0		SWG	
Issue 2613: Interfaces on Nodes	deferred 2.0		SWG	
Issue 3291: UML RTF 1.4 Issue: Missing notation mapping for association in composite	deferred 2.0	small	SWG	
Issue 3391: UML 1.4 RTF Issue: Multiple languages for uninterpreted strings	deferred 2.0		SWG	
Issue 3394: UML 1.4 RTF Issue: Multiple languages for uninterpreted strings	duplicate 3391		SWG	
Issue 2071: BooleanExpression written in OCL or some other language?	fixed in 1.3		SWG	
Issue 2074: Some attributes can be expressed in OCL	rejected		SWG	
Issue 2283: Interface issue	rejected		SWG	Bad reasoning. It chooses not to use the attributes potentially available to Classifier. Don't go misapplying the LSP.
Issue 2284: Add responsibilities as a new metatype	rejected		SWG	Responsibilities have no semantics and can easily be modeled as tagged values or comments.
Issue 2294: Dependencies (and other relationships) with role ends	rejected		SWG	Dependencies are between elements and don't apply to instances. Associations are for relationships whose semantics apply to instances. There are already a lot of symbols and multi-instances of other elements do not seem important enough to justify adding more symbols, symmetry notwithstanding.
Issue 2295: UML has symbol for multiobject, not for multi-instances of other classifie	rejected		SWG	
Issue 2850: Generalization should be meta-metamodel element	rejected		SWG	We do not agree at all with this reasoning.
Issue 2921: Use of interfaces in associations	rejected		SWG	Associations relate things that can actually exist, that is, classes. The arguments about OCL access are peripheral and should be directed to OCL. Not true. Owner scope tells whether there is one global instance of the feature or one per classifier. Target scope tells whether the contained value is a reference to an instance or a classifier.
Issue 3279: UML RTF 1.4 Issue: ownerScope and targetScope	rejected	small	SWG	The phrase "in the metamodel" is totally unnecessary but not wrong and too hard to remove.
Issue 3372: use of the phrase "In the metamodel..." is unclear	rejected	small	SWG	

ISSUE	ACTION	ASSESSMENT	WORK GROUP	RESOLUTION
Issue 1016: UML 1.0: Template example cannot be represented in model	resolved	med	SWG	To address the issue of proper binding of Template parameters, a new metaclass TemplateArgument has been added, with relationships to ModelElement and Binding.
Issue 1183: Correspondence between operation and method (02)	resolved	med	SWG	Explicitly statement has been inserted.
Issue 1710: Text on page 2-49 section 2.2	resolved	small	SWG	Changed Comment to be a ModelElement and added a body:String attribute to it.
Issue 1943: Associations as parts of a composite.	resolved	med	SWG	Stated that a composite object can contain both objects and links as parts.
Issue 2001: Not instantiable	resolved		SWG	Added text to clarify each use of the word "instantiable".
Issue 2279: Metamodel and semantics for aggregations needs clarification	resolved			Reworded to make clear that owner has responsibility for parts but parts can be explicitly detached from owner. Removed references to "coincident lifetime"
Issue 2280: On aggregation. The white diamond name should be "shareable"	resolved	small	SWG	semantics from notation and glossary.
Issue 2281: Use of black diamond in the metamodel	resolved		SWG	The words have been changed to a more complete phrasing.
Issue 3121: Language Name (uml-rtf)	resolved		SWG	The semantics of composition have been restated, The rest of the submitted issue is a matter of opinion and is therefore rejected.
Issue 3283: UML RTF 1.4 Issue: <- keyword/stereotype	resolved	small	SWG	Followed submitter's recommendation to use official language names.
Issue 3290: UML RTF 1.4 Issue: Duplicate association end names from Constraint.	resolved	small	SWG	Kept enumeration keyword, which is not defined, and removed primitive keyword.
Issue 3316: Notation for Namespace ownership	resolved		SWG	Renamed one of the end names "constrainedStereotype"
Issue 3377: Ad 3.69.3. In these paragraphs, it should be "Classifier" rather than "Cl	resolved		SWG	Removed nested package notation for nested classes. Declined to broaden "anchor" notation to Namespace in general.
Issue 3393: UML 1.4 RTF Issue: changeability in associations	resolved		SWG	Changed to Classifier.
Issue 3395: UML 1.4 RTF Issue: Ordering of attribute values	resolved		SWG	Clarified changeability to refer to operations of the source class.
Issue 3396: UML 1.4 RTF Issue: Association generalization has notation but no semantics	resolved		SWG	Added ordering attribute to class Attribute.
Issue 3397: UML RTF 1.4 editorial comments (Part 2 Diagram Elements)	resolved		SWG	Added some semantics but noted that UML 2.0 would likely expand the semantics.
Issue 4120: Notation Internationalization issues	resolved	small	SWG	Made changes as suggested (note that instance of Operation is Invocation, not Method)
Issue 815: Error on association owners	resolved	med	SWG	Notation issues from Japanese ISO review - italics and certain characters made option: OCL changed to say the associations must be visible from the defining package, but they may be defined in other packages.
Issue i001: Define the set of features that are inheritable for a Classifier	resolved	med	SWG	Attempted to list inheritable feature for each kind of GeneralizableElement
Issue i002: Verify that inheritable features rule applies to all subtypes of Classifier (UC, Act, IF etc)	resolved	med	SWG	Attempted to list inheritable feature for each kind of GeneralizableElement
Issue i004: Define the set of Inheritable features for Association	resolved	med	SWG	Attempted to list inheritable feature for each kind of GeneralizableElement
Issue i008: Change model and doc to allow navigability from Classifier to AssEnds	resolved	small	SWG	Removed visibility arrows.
Issue 3284: UML RTF 1.4 Issue: Flow relationship has the incorrect semantics	resolved	small (2.0)	SWG, AWG	Removed references to activity graphs flow states. The stereotypes become and copy are consistent with the definition of Flow. Distinguish from ObjectFlowState, which may be the same at a deeper level, but not at the surface.
Issue 3408: UML 1.4 RTF Issue: Namespace notation too specific	rejected		SWG, MMWG	The plus-sign notation is restricted to packages and classifiers. Any broadening is deferred until UML 2.0, if at all.
Issue 3325: "Unused" data types	resolved		SWG, PhWG	Removed MessageDirectionKind and Time from the metamodel. They are unused.
Issue 2292: UML Semantics, OMG-UML V1.2 Use Cases	rejected		UWG	TypeExpression is now referenced only within ProgrammingLanguageDataType.
Issue 3399: UML RTF 1.4 editorial comments (Part 6 - Use Case Diagrams)	rejected		UWG	